VZCZCXYZ0000 OO RUEHWEB

DE RUCNDT #1436/01 2131446
ZNR UUUUU ZZH
O 011446Z AUG 06
FM USMISSION USUN NEW YORK
TO RUEHC/SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 9711
INFO RUEHGG/UN SECURITY COUNCIL COLLECTIVE IMMEDIATE

UNCLAS USUN NEW YORK 001436

STPDIS

SIPDIS

IO/PSC FOR BETSY FITZGERALD; S/CT FOR JOHN SANDAGE

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: PREL PTER UNGA UNSC KFTN KNNP

SUBJECT: CTC CHAIRMAN APPEALS FOR U.S. LEADERSHIP

- 11. (SBU) Danish PermRep Ellen Margrethe Loj, the Chairman of the Security Council's Counter-Terrorism Committee (CTC), told Amb. Bolton, Wolff, and Sanders on July 28 that she fears the CTC is foundering and appealed for the United States to articulate consistent, clear goals for the CTC. Loj argued that from the U.S. approach in the CTC it is difficult to discern the U.S.'s strategy for fighting terrorism through the United Nations. Amb. Bolton said the United States would take time in August to reflect upon Loj's comments and suggested a P-3 meeting with the Danes in early September to work to reach agreement on next steps.
- 12. (SBU) Without clear direction from the United States and the other P-5, Loj said the CTC might become no more than a "paper mill" with no credibility among the UN membership, particular developing countries. Resolving the CTC's problems is essential to preserve the authority of the Security Council's overall efforts to counter terrorism, Loj argued.
- ¶3. (U) In particular, Loj said the United States has not identified clearly its objectives for the CTC and instead has taken "inconsistent positions" in the CTC that make it difficult for her to lead or for the CTC to accomplish its work. (Comment: Although she did not cite it in the meeting, we understand Loj is frustrated that the CTC's efforts to implement para 90 of the 2005 Outcome Document have been stymied by lack of a U.S. position. End Comment.) For example, she said the United States argues that the CTC must achieve concrete, measurable results but then does not object when the Counter-Terrorism Committee's Executive Directorate (CTED) issues reports on its work that reveal in her view show inadequate results. The U.S. delegation's inconsistent views demonstrate a lack of a coherent strategy for countering terrorism through the United Nations, she argued, speculating that the U.S. delegation might receive instructions from different offices at different times.
- 14. (U) She also asked for clarification on whether the United States wants the CTC to judge states' compliance now, dividing states into compliant and non-compliant categories, or whether the United States wants the CTC to focus on assisting states and convincing them to implement their obligations under resolution 1373 (2001). Some CTC members including at times the United States - seem to want the CTC to move quickly to assess compliance. Loj said the United States' own views on compliance seem to be conflicted; the U.S. delegation pushed the CTC hard to press Paraguay to fulfill its obligations but praised CTED's recent trip to Jordan as a success even when CTED learned on that visit that Jordan, like Paraguay, had failed to adopt counterterrorism legislation despite assistance from the UN Office of Drugs and Crimes, which made four trips to help draft the bill. response to Amb. Bolton, Loj said CTED leans toward focusing immediately on assessing states' compliance.

- 15. (U) If the CTC tries to judge states' compliance now, Loj said the CTC would find close to 100 states mostly developing countries have not fulfilled their obligations. She also questioned whether the CTC has the mandate to judge countries' compliance, noting that resolution 1373 refers only to the CTC's role in monitoring states' implementation of the resolution. In response to Amb. Bolton, she said the CTC should move toward judging compliance at some point, but it needs to lay the groundwork now to help states that are willing but unable to implement their obligations. CTED must do more to follow up on the visits it makes to states, she argued, saying that the trips cannot only be a means for CTED to collect information about states.
- 16. (U) Loj also expressed concern about the lack of cooperation and information sharing among the CTC, the 1267 Committee, and the 1540 Committee but stressed that Denmark does not support proposals to merge the three committees. No ambassador would be able to chair a joint committee responsible for so many technical issues, she said, but the three committees must do much more to coordinate their activities.
- 17. (SBU) Amb. Bolton agreed that the CTC must decide on its next steps but said the problems Loj identified reflect larger political issues that reflect a problem with the Security Council. He argued that we might need to address the broader question about whether the Security Council is an appropriate vehicle to counter terrorism. One could view counterterrorism as a fight based "90 percent on intelligence," most of which the United States can share only with a few countries, he said, making the UN an inappropriate vehicle to accomplish results. Loj disagreed, citing the broad scope of resolution 1373, which covers issues well beyond intelligence-sharing, including border security, port

security, terrorism financing, and denial of safe havens.

- 18. (U) Loj argued that countries can fulfill many of their obligations under resolution 1373 through "good governance," and donor nations need to do more to coordinate their development assistance and their counterterrorism strategies. Acknowledging her personal background in development, she said the CTC needs to show developing countries that by establishing measures to protect their borders or banking systems from terrorists, they also can attract foreign investment. (Comment: Loj headed the Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA) for five years and spent most of her career on development-related issues. She has pressed the CTC and CTED to do more to coordinate efforts with the UNDP and other development agencies, and Denmark's Foreign Ministry has commissioned a study of how to coordinate development assistance and counterterrorism assistance more effectively. End Comment.)
- 19. (SBU) Loj also discussed the relationship between the CTC and CTED, expressing concerns about the lines of oversight of CTED. Although CTED serves at the policy direction of the CTC and is under the UN Secretariat's administrative control, Loj said those lines remain "blurred," as last year's report of the Office of Internal Oversight found. Loj stressed that the concerns she was raising were not focused on CTED Executive Director Javier Ruperez. (Comment: Loj and Ruperez have battled one another for more than one year over policy issues facing the CTC but she is correct in saying that the issues she has raised are not personal. End Comment.) Loj said the P-5 need to provide clear directions to CTED, and if CTED does not act on those directions, the P-5 need to object.